

**CIVIL MINUTE ENTRY**

**CIVIL CAUSE FOR ORAL ARGUMENT  
Before Magistrate Judge Ramon E. Reyes, Jr.**

**05-CV-2455(KAM)(RER)  
Boyd et al v. J.E. Robert Co., Inc. et al**

**Appearances:**

**For Plaintiff: Paul Grobman**

**For Defendant: Jonathan David Elliot, Esq (J.E. Robert & JER), Stephen Edward Kitzinger, (NYCTL)**

**Motion for spoliation [104] Denied without prejudice to renewal after paper discovery is completed. Discovery on debt cancellation fees limited to random samples of fifty (50) “files” from each trust. If parties cannot agree how to conduct random samples they must submit a joint letter with competing methods no later than 7/24/09. Defendant JER to produce litigation files for five (5) named plaintiffs. Request for post 2005 documents Denied without prejudice. Defendant NYCTL Trusts to produce servicing agreement for other servicing agencies for the various Trusts at issue in this law suit; Plaintiff to serve Rule 45 subpoenas on other servicing agency for policy and procedure manuals. Request for litigation status reports from outside attorneys to JER Denied. (Request 10). Request for interrogatory No. 5 denied. Interrogatory No.(10) to NYCTL Trusts denied without prejudice to renewal after NYCTL Trusts determine if other servicing agents serviced the NYCTL Trusts**